

---

## Effects of heavy metals on rhizobial growth

**BOGIĆ MILIČIĆ\*, DUŠICA DELIĆ, OLIVERA STAJKOVIĆ, NATAŠA RASULIĆ,  
ĐORĐE KUZMANOVIĆ, DRAGANA JOŠIĆ**

*Institute of Soil Science, Teodora Drajzera 7, 11000 Belgrade,  
Serbia*

*\*Corresponding author:*

*Bogić Miličić, Department for Microbiology, Institute of Soil Science, Teodora Drajzera 7  
11000 Beograd, Serbia,*

### Abstract

*Effects of different concentrations of several heavy metals (Pb, Hg, Cd, Zn, Cu, Ni and Cr) on the growth of 16 strains of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum*, 15 strains of *Sinorhizobium meliloti*, 24 strains of *Rhizobium leguminosarum* (8 bv. *phaseoli*, 8 bv. *viciae* and 8 bv. *trifolii*), 4 strains of *Rhizobium loti* and 3 strains of *Rhizobium galegae*, all from a collection of the Soil Science Institute, were tested on YMA nutrient media containing Congo red.*

*The results clearly show different levels of intrinsic tolerance of rhizobial strains to the applied concentrations of heavy metals in terms of growth. All strains tested displayed the lowest intrinsic tolerance when growing on Ni and Cu, while most strains were found to have the highest intrinsic tolerance to Pb, Zn and Hg. Cd and Cr concentrations of 50-75  $\mu\text{gml}^{-1}$  had inhibitory effect on the growth of most rhizobial strains tested. Differences in growth on different concentrations of heavy metals were found not only among different rhizobial species, but among rhizobia of identical species as well, which shows their different genetic structures resulting from indigenous biodiversity.*

Keywords: Heavy metals, Rhizobia, Growth, Metal tolerance.

### Introduction

Heavy metals are widely distributed in the biosphere, and their concentrations in soils and surface waters vary. Soils and waters can also be contaminated with heavy metals from different anthropogenic sources, such as smelters, mines, power stations, metal-rich pesticides, fertilizers, waste waters, etc. [14, 24, 5]. Over the past ten years, there has been a growing concern over increased heavy metal pollution of soils and waters, and the resulting toxicity to plants, animals and microorganisms, as well as their irreversible binding to various soil components [23, 25]. They have been found harmful to various associations of plants and microorganisms. Regarding mycorrhizae, the size of mycorrhizal roots has been found to decrease in soils containing high concentrations of heavy metals such as Cu, Pb and Zn [18]. Waste waters containing high concentrations of heavy metals have also been shown to inhibit mycorrhizal infection of soybean, especially in soils with low pH [11]. It has been proved that  $\text{CuSO}_4$  affects nitrogen mineralization depending on soil pH, with acid soils (pH 5.1 and 5.9) being more tolerant to high concentrations of this agent ( $1000 \mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ ) and neutral soils (pH 7.3) showing a tendency of decreasing nitrogen mineralization under  $100 \mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration of  $\text{CuSO}_4$ . Accumulation of mineralized nitrogen under such pH conditions was complete when it was in nitrate form [16]. Plant uptake of heavy metals (Cu, Pb, Zn and Cd)

from soil is highest in sandy soils, especially that of Zn and Cd, which are considerably more mobile than Pb and Cu. Total plant uptake of heavy metals was lowest in organic soils [7].

Pb and Cu are less mobile than Zn and Cd. Ni, Cd and Zn are potentially more serious contaminants of soil solutions than Cu and Pb [6]. The amount of heavy metals accumulated in a soil would depend on the degree of their emission from a source, their transport to an accumulation site and their retention in soil. Some metals, such as Zn, Cu, Ni and Cr, are essential and beneficial micronutrients to plants, animals and microorganisms and they uptake them by various metabolic processes, in contrast to non-essential ones (Cd, Hg and Pb), whose physiological function has not been fully clarified and uptake occurs by non-metabolic mechanisms [8, 20, 4]. Several studies so far have shown harmful effect of heavy metals on the growth, morphology and activity of microorganisms, including rhizobia, as well as on N<sub>2</sub> fixation [22, 19, 13, 1, 15].

Symbiotic nitrogen fixation has an important role in providing host plants with nitrogen and increasing their yield, as well as in soil enrichment with nitrogen for succeeding crops. Rhizobia are Gram-negative soil bacteria that are capable of performing N<sub>2</sub> fixation with leguminous crops, which is crucial for preserving soil fertility [17, 2]. As much as 25-400 kgN ha<sup>-1</sup> in soil is retrieved annually through this association of legumes and rhizobia to provide for subsequent crops, and the process depends on the plant as a macrosymbiont and the rhizobial strain as a microsymbiont, as well as on a series of abiotic and biotic factors [8, 3, 12]. Substitution of mineral N fertilizers, especially in the production of staple legumes, with microbiological fertilizers containing active rhizobial agents enables substantial energy savings (> 25 10<sup>9</sup> J t<sup>-1</sup>) in the production process and reduces threats of environmental pollution caused by continuing or excessive use of mineral N fertilizers.

It is noteworthy that absence of nitrogen fixation in clover crops grown on soils contaminated with heavy metals over a long period of time has been found to result from a survival only of ineffective rhizobial strains [14]. Further more, rhizobia can be used as good indicator organism to estimate the level stress imposed on rhizobia to several toxic chemicals including heavy metals [10, 21]. Consequently, our research focused on investigating the effect of heavy metals on rhizobial growth so as to be able to identify tolerant and highly effective strains suitable to be used as microbiological nitrogen fertilizers for major legumes production.

## Materials and methods

The effects of different heavy metal concentrations were investigated on Yeast Mannitol Agar (YMA) medium supplemented with Congo red [9]. We tested 16 strains of *B. japonicum*, 15 strains of *S. meliloti*, 24 strains of *R. leguminosarum* (8 bv. *phaseoli*, 8 bv. *viciae* and 8 bv. *trifolii*), 4 strains of *R. loti* and 3 strains of *R. galegae*, all from a collection of the Institute of Soil Science.

Pb was applied as compound Pb(CH<sub>3</sub>COO)<sub>2</sub> at concentrations of: 10, 25, 50, 75, 100, 150, 175 and 200 µg·ml<sup>-1</sup>; Hg as HgCl<sub>2</sub> (2, 5, 10, 20, 50, 75 and 100 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>); Cd as 3CdSO<sub>4</sub> 8H<sub>2</sub>O (2, 5, 10, 20, 50 and 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>); Zn as ZnSO<sub>4</sub> 7H<sub>2</sub>O (5, 10, 25, 50, 75 and 100 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>); Cu as CuSO<sub>4</sub> 5H<sub>2</sub>O (2, 5, 10, 20 and 25 µgml<sup>-1</sup>); Ni as NiSO<sub>4</sub> 7H<sub>2</sub>O (2, 5, 10, 20 and 25 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>); and Cr as K<sub>2</sub>Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub> (5, 10, 20, 25, 50 and 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>).

The rhizobial strains were examined by adding their respective cultures, established on YMB medium with approximately 10<sup>9</sup> cells per ml, onto YMA media supplemented with appropriate heavy metal concentrations using multiple inoculator with 48 injectors, according to Handbook for Rhizobia [17] and with four replicates. After incubation in air bath at 26°C

for 4-7 days, visual assessment of growth was carried out using three marks: + (good growth), ± (weak growth) and – (no growth), as compared to control.

## Results and discussion

Growth of unicellular microorganisms, including rhizobia, can be measured using two different parameters: cell mass and cells numbers, and the values acquired may not coincide. Mass of individual cells varies in different stages of growth and increases continuously over time, while cell numbers increase in a process that has interruptions caused by cell division at regular time intervals. Generation time for fast-growing rhizobia is 2-4 h, and for slow-growing 6-8 h. In this investigation, the growth of rhizobial strains applied to different heavy metals concentrations was determined visually based on cell mass increase.

Of the 16 *B. japonicum* strains tested, good growth at Pb concentration of 175 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> was found in 10 strains (507, 518, 519, 520, 524, 526, 531, 533, 538 and 539), weak growth in 5 strains, and no growth in strain 542. Pb concentration of 200 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> fully inhibited the growth of another 7 strains and significantly decreased growth of 5 more strains of *B. japonicum*. Only strains 507, 526 and 539 were found to grow well under that concentration (Table1).

**Table 1.** Highest concentration values of heavy metals affecting growth of *B. japonicum* strains.

<i>B. japonicum</i> strain	Heavy metal concentration (µg ml <sup>-1</sup> )														
	∅	Pb		Hg		Cd		Zn		Cu		Ni		Cr	
		175	200	50	75	20	50	75	100	10	20	10	20	50	75
505	+	± -	± -	- -	+ ±	- -	+ ±	± -	- -	- -	- -	- -	- -	- -	
507	+	+ +	+ -	± -	+ +	± -	+ +	± -	- -	- -	± -	- -	± -	- -	
518	+	+ ±	+ ±	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	± -	- -	- -	- -	- -	+ -	- -	
519	+	+ -	+ +	+ -	+ -	+ -	+ ±	- -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	- -	- -	
520	+	+ ±	± -	± -	± -	± -	+ ±	- -	+ -	- -	± -	- -	± -	- -	
522	+	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	+ +	+ -	- -	± -	- -	± -	- -	
523	+	± -	+ -	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	+ +	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	+ +	- -	
524	+	+ ±	+ -	± -	+ +	± -	+ +	- -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	+ +	- -	
526	+	+ +	+ ±	+ ±	+ +	+ ±	+ +	+ +	- -	- -	- -	- -	+ -	- -	
527	+	± -	± -	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	± -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	- -	- -	
531	+	+ ±	± -	± -	+ ±	± -	+ ±	- -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	+ +	- -	
532	+	± -	+ -	± -	+ +	± -	+ +	+ +	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	± -	- -	
533	+	+ -	+ ±	- -	+ ±	- -	+ ±	± -	- -	- -	- -	- -	± -	- -	
538	+	+ ±	± -	- -	+ +	- -	+ +	+ +	- -	- -	- -	- -	- -	- -	
539	+	+ +	± -	- -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	- -	- -	- -	- -	+ +	- -	
542	+	- -	± -	- -	± -	- -	± -	± -	+ -	- -	+ -	- -	- -	- -	

\* ∅ – control; (+) good growth; (±) weak growth; (-) no growth;

Nine strains of *B. japonicum* had good growth at Hg concentration of 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> and 7 strains had weak growth, while the concentration of 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> caused no growth of 11 strains and weak growth of 4 strains. Strain 519 alone was tolerant to that Hg concentration. Cd concentration of 20 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> inhibited the growth of 5 strains and decreased growth of 9 strains of *B. japonicum*. Good growth under this Cd concentration was only found in strains 519 and 526, while 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration inhibited growth of all strains tested except 526, which

had weak growth. Zn concentration of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  did not inhibit growth of all *B. japonicum* strains tested, and its concentration of 100  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  was found to produce good growth of strains 507, 524, 526, 532 and 538, weak growth of 9 strains, and no growth of strains 539 and 542. All *B. japonicum* strains tested showed the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Cu and Ni. Cu concentration of 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited the growth of 5 *B. japonicum* strains, while weak growth was recorded for 6 strains. Only strains 522, 523, 526, 532 and 538 displayed good growth at Cu concentration of 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , while the other strains had no growth at all. Ni concentration of 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  had an inhibitory effect on the growth of 7 strains of *B. japonicum*, in contrast to the other strains that recorded good growth on that concentration, while 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration left all strains tested without any growth. Cr concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , and especially of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , inhibited or reduced the growth of most tested strains of *B. japonicum*, except strains 523, 524, 531 and 539, which showed good growth under 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration.

Of the 15 *S. meliloti* strains tested, good growth was recorded for strains 215, 218, 219, 236, 241 and 247 at Pb concentration of 175-200  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , while growth of all other strains was weak or missing (Table 2).

**Table 2.** Highest concentration values of heavy metals affecting growth of *S. meliloti* strains.

<i>S. meliloti</i> strain	Heavy metal concentration ( $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ )														
	Ø	Pb		Hg		Cd		Zn		Cu		Ni		Cr	
		175	200	50	75	20	50	25	50	5	10	10	20	10	20
204	+	± -	± -	± -	+	-	+	-	-	-	± -	± -	± -	± -	
215	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	-	+	-	+	-	+	-	
218	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	-	± -	-	+	±	+	-	
219	+	+	+	+	±	-	+	-	± -	-	-	-	+	±	
222	+	± -	± -	± -	± -	-	-	-	-	-	± -	-	± -	-	
224	+	± -	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	±	+	-	
236	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	±	-	-	
239	+	± -	+	-	+	-	± -	-	± -	-	+	-	± -	-	
241	+	+	+	+	+	±	±	±	+	+	-	-	+	-	
242	+	-	-	+	-	±	-	-	± -	-	+	-	+	-	
244	+	± -	+	-	-	-	-	-	± -	-	± -	-	+	-	
245	+	-	-	+	+	-	-	-	± -	-	± -	-	-	-	
246	+	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	± -	-	± -	-	
247	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	-	± -	-	+	-	+	-	
249	+	± -	+	+	±	-	-	-	+	-	± -	-	-	-	

\* Ø – control; (+) good growth; (±) weak growth; (-) no growth;

Hg concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited growth of strain 246, while 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration caused good growth of strains 224, 236, 241, 245 and 249 and no growth of the other strains tested. Cd concentration of 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited growth of strains 244, 245 and 246, while its concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  was found to cause good growth of strain 236 and weak growth of strain 241. Zn concentration of 25  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited growth of 9 strains of *S. meliloti*, while 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration was found to cause good growth of strains 224 and 236, and no growth of all other strains tested. All *S. meliloti* strains tested displayed the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Cu and Ni. Cu concentration of 5-10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited or reduced

growth of most strains tested. Good growth was only found in strains 215, 224, 236, 241 and 249. At 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration of Ni, weak or no growth were found in most tested strains of *S. meliloti*, except strains 215, 218, 224, 236, 239, 242 and 247, which grew well. Ni concentration of 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  produced no growth of most strains tested. Cr concentration of 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited growth in strains 236, 245 and 249, while none of the strains showed any growth at 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration.

Concerning the 8 strains each of the tested *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and *viciae*, most of them were found to achieve good growth at Pb concentration of 175  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ . Pb concentration of 200  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  inhibited growth of two *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* strains (133 and 134), in contrast to most *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* strains that had good growth (Table 3).

**Table 3.** Highest concentration values of heavy metals affecting growth of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and *viciae* strains.

Rhizobia		Heavy metal concentration ( $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ )														
		$\emptyset$	Pb		Hg		Cd		Zn		Cu		Ni		Cr	
species	strain		175	200	50	75	50	75	50	75	5	10	5	10	50	75
<i>R. leguminosarum</i> bv. <i>phaseoli</i>	110	+	+	+	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	-	-	$\pm$	-	-	-
	120	+	+	+	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-
	123	+	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	-	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-
	126	+	+	$\pm$	+	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-
	130	+	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	-	-	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-
	132	+	+	+	+	+	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$
	133	+	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	134	+	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-
<i>R. leguminosarum</i> bv. <i>viciae</i>	301	+	+	+	-	-	$\pm$	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	311	+	+	+	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	+
	312	+	+	+	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	-	-
	316	+	+	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	-	-	-	-
	318	+	+	+	$\pm$	-	+	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-	$\pm$	-	-	-
	320	+	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-	-	-	$\pm$	-	-	-	-	-
	321	+	+	+	+	$\pm$	-	-	-	-	+	$\pm$	+	$\pm$	$\pm$	-
	322	+	+	+	-	-	$\pm$	-	-	-	+	$\pm$	-	-	$\pm$	-

\*  $\emptyset$  – control; (+) good growth; ( $\pm$ ) weak growth; (-) no growth;

Hg inhibited growth of 3 *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* strains (301, 316 and 322) at concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , while 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration caused either weak growth or no growth of most strains of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and *viciae*. Cd concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  acted inhibitory on the growth of strains 123 and 134 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and strain 321 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae*, while most strains of the two rhizobia species had weak growth or no growth at 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration. At 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration of Zn, good growth was recorded for strains 130 and 132 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and strain 312 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae*, while concentration of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  caused all strains of both rhizobial species to display weak growth or no growth at all. All strains tested in both rhizobial species showed the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Cu and Ni. At Cu concentration of 5  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , good growth was found only in strain 134 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and 4 strains of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* (311, 312, 321 and 322), while its concentration of 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  caused all strains to show weak growth or no growth in both

rhizobial species. Good growth was found in strains 130 and 132 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and 3 strains of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* (311, 312 and 321) at 5 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration of Ni, while weak growth or no growth were recorded for all strains of both species at 10 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration. Cr concentration of 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> was found to cause good growth only of strain 132 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *phaseoli* and strain 311 of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *viciae*, while growth of all other strains tested was weak or missing, and this was especially so at 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration.

Regarding the 8 tested strains of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii*, most had good growth at Pb concentration of 175 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>, while the 200 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration resulted in weak growth or no growth of most strains, the exception being strains 407 and 409 (Table 4).

**Table 4.** Highest concentration values of heavy metals affecting growth of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii* strains.

bv. <i>R. leg. trifolii</i>	Heavy metal concentration (µg ml <sup>-1</sup> )														
	∅	Pb		Hg		Cd		Zn		Cu		Ni		Cr	
		175	200	20	50	50	75	50	75	5	10	5	10	50	75
407	+	+	+	±	-	±	-	-	-	+	±	±	-	+	-
409	+	+	+	+	±	±	-	±	-	-	-	-	-	+	±
451	+	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	-	-	+	±	±	-
459	+	+	±	-	-	-	-	-	-	±	-	±	-	-	-
461	+	+	±	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	+	±	-	-
464	+	+	±	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	+	±	-	-
467	+	+	±	±	-	+	±	±	-	+	±	-	-	-	-
469	+	±	-	±	-	-	-	+	±	±	-	+	+	±	-

\* ∅ – control; (+) good growth; (±) weak growth; (-) no growth;

At 20 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration of Hg, good growth of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii* strains was recorded only for strain 409, while all other strains had weak growth or no growth, and this especially applied to 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration. Cd concentration of 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> resulted in no growth of strains 459 and 469, while the growth of all other strains was weak or there was no growth at all, and this was even more evident at 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration. Similar effect was recorded by Zn concentration of 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>, which caused good growth of strain 469, while all other strains had weak growth or no growth, especially at 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration. All *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii* strains tested showed the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Cu and Ni. Good growth was found only in strains 407 and 467 at 5 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration of Cu, while the growth of all other strains was weak or there was no growth, and this was especially so at 10 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration. Ni concentration of 5 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> was found to cause good growth of 3 strains (461, 464 and 469), while all other strains had weak or no growth at all. Strain 469 was found to have good growth at its concentration of 10 µg ml<sup>-1</sup>, while all other strains had weak growth or no growth. Good growth of *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii* strains tested was recorded for strains 407 and 409 at 50 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration of Cr, while most other strains had weak or no growth, at 75 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> concentration in particular.

Of the 4 *R. loti* and 3 *R. galegae* strains tested, good growth at Pb concentration of 175 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> was found for 2 strains of *R. loti* (601 and 612) and 2 strains of *R. galegae* (801 and 802) (Table 5).

Strains 801 and 802 of *R. galegae* were found to have good growth at its concentration of 200 µg ml<sup>-1</sup> as well, while *R. loti* strains produced weak or no growth at the same

concentration. Good growth of *R. loti* strain 612 and *R. galegae* strain 804 were recorded at 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration of Hg, while growth of all other strains was weak or there was no growth at all, especially *R. loti* strains. Strain 804 grew well at Hg concentration of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , while most strains tested had no growth. Good growth of strain 612 of *R. loti* was found at Cd concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , while all other strains of both rhizobial species had weak or no growth, especially at 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration. Zn concentration of 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  was found to result in good growth of *R. loti* strains 612 and 615 and *R. galegae* strain 801, while all other strains had weak or no growth. Zn concentration of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  acted inhibitory on the growth of most strains in both rhizobial species. Strains of both rhizobial species showed the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Cu and Ni. At 5  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentrations both of Cu and Ni, good growth was recorded for *R. loti* strain 612 and *R. galegae* strain 804, while 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentrations resulted in weak growth or no growth of either rhizobial species. Good growth was found in *R. loti* strain 612 at 50  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration of Cr, while growth was weak or there was none recorded for any other strain in either rhizobial species, especially at 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  concentration.

**Table 5.** Highest concentration values of heavy metals affecting growth of *R. loti* and *R. galegae* strains.

Rhizobia		Heavy metal concentration ( $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ )															
		$\emptyset$	Pb		Hg		Cd		Zn		Cu		Ni		Cr		
species	strain		175	200	50	75	50	75	50	75	5	10	5	10	50	75	
<i>R. loti</i>	601	+	+ ±	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	±	-	±	-
	608	+	±	-	±	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	±	-	±	-
	612	+	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±
	615	+	±	-	-	-	±	-	+ ±	±	-	-	-	±	-	±	-
<i>R. galegae</i>	801	+	+ +	±	-	±	-	+ ±	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	-
	802	+	+ +	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-	±	-
	804	+	±	-	+ +	±	-	±	-	±	-	+ ±	+ ±	+ ±	±	-	-

\*  $\emptyset$  – control; (+) good growth; (±) weak growth; (-) no growth;

Tolerance of the strains investigated in this study was inconsistent with data reported by Tong and Sadvoska (1994) from a similar research on *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii*. The concentrations of Cd and Zn are consistent for all rhizobial species, but the minimum inhibitory concentration of Ni for *R. leguminosarum* bv. *trifolii* strains tested in our study was considerably lower (10 and 20  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ ), compared to 80  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  for strains Tal 1820 and Tal 1824 reported by the authors. Of a total of 62 strains, 29 were found to be susceptible to 10  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  Ni. The strains tested in this study were found to display higher tolerance to Hg, with 19 strains being tolerant to concentration of 75  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ , whereas the other authors reported MIC < 1  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$  Hg. Based on the significant difference in degrees of tolerance to some heavy metals, both among different rhizobial species and within them, various authors have made recommendations regarding selective media for differentiation between different groups of rhizobia. Tong and Sadowsky (1994) had recommended a selective medium for *B. japonicum* (BJSM). They also found that fast-growing rhizobia were more susceptible to Zn and Co (20-40  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ ) than slow-growing (80-480  $\mu\text{g ml}^{-1}$ ), and less susceptible to Mo.

## Conclusion

The results of this investigation clearly indicate different levels of intrinsic tolerance of the investigated rhizobia strains in terms of their growth under various heavy metal concentrations applied.

All rhizobial strains tested were found to display the lowest intrinsic tolerance to Ni and Cu. Most strains showed the highest intrinsic tolerance to Pb, Zn and Hg. Cd and Cr concentrations of 50-75 µgml<sup>-1</sup> acted inhibitory to growth of most rhizobial strains tested.

Differences in growth at various concentrations of heavy metals were recorded not only for different rhizobial species but strains of the same species as well, which shows differences in their genetic structure originating from their indigenous biodiversity.

## Acknowledgement

This research was supported by the Ministry of Science and Environmental Protection of Republic of Serbia, Project, No TR-006875B.

## References

1. A. LAKZIAN, P. MURPHY, A. TURNER, J.L. BEYNON, K.E. GILLER: *Rhizobium leguminosarum* bv. *viciae* populations in soils with increasing heavy metal contamination: abundance, plasmid pro-files, diversity and metal tolerance. *Soil Biol. Biochem.*, **34**, 519–529 (2002).
2. A.M. IBEKWE, J.S. ANGLE, R.L. CHANEY, P. VAN BERKUM: *Sewage sludge and heavy metal effects on nodulation and nitrogen fixation of legumes*. *J. Environ. Qual.*, **24**, 1199–1204 (1995).
3. A.M. IBEKWE, J.S. ANGLE, R.L. CHANEY, P.VAN BERKUM: *Differentiation of clover Rhizobium isolated from biosolids amended soils with varying pH*. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.*, **61**, 1679–1685 (1997).
4. B.J. ALLOWAY: *Heavy metals in soils*. *Blakie Academic*, London. p. 368 (1995).
5. B. ROBINSON, C. RUSSELL, M. HEDLEY, B. CLOTHIER: *Cadmium adsorption by rhizobacteria: implications for New Zealand pastureland*. *Agric. Eco. Environ.*, **87**, 315–321 (2001).
6. C.C. BIDDAPA, M. CHINO, K. KUMAZAVA: *Migration of heavy metals in two Japanese soils*. *Plant and Soil*, **66**(3), 299–316 (1982).
7. G. KROG BJERRE, H.H. SCHIERUP: *Uptake of six heavy metals by oat as influenced by soil type and additions of cadmium, lead, zinc and copper*. *Plant and Soil*, **88**(1), 57–69 (1985).
8. G.M. GADD, A.J. GRIFFITHS: *Microorganisms and heavy metal toxicity*. *Microbial. Ecol.*, **4**, 303–317 (1978).
9. J. M. VINCENT: *A Manual for the Practical Study of the Root Nodule Bacteria, International Biological Programme Handbook, No.15, Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford* (1970).
10. J.L. BOTSFORD: *A simple method for determining the toxicity of chemicals using a bacterial indicator organism*. *Environ. Toxicol. Chem.*, **14**, 285–289 (1999).
11. J.S. ANGLE, J.R. HECKMAN: *Effect of soil pH and sewage sludge on VA mycorrhizal infection of soybeans*. *Plant and Soil*, **93**(3), 437 (1986).
12. K. SAEKI, T. KUNITO, H. OYAIZU, S. MATSUMOTO: *Relationships between bacterial tolerance levels and forms of copper and zinc in soils*. *J. Environ. Qual.*, **31**, 1570–1575 (2002).



13. K.E. GILLER, E. WITTER, S.P. McGRATH: *Toxicity of heavy metals to microorganisms and microbial process in agricultural soils: a review. Soil Biol. Biochem.*, **30**, 1389–1414 (1998).
14. K.E. GILLER, S.P. McGRATH, P.R. HIRSCH: *Absence of nitrogen fixation in clover grown on soil subject to long-term contamination with heavy metals is due to survival of only ineffective Rhizobium. Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, **21**, (6), 841-848 (1989).
15. M. KHAN, J. SCULLION: *Effects of metal (Cd, Cu, Ni, Pb or Zn) enrichment of sewage-sludge on soil micro-organisms and their activities. Appl. Soil Ecol.*, **20**, 145–155 (2002).
16. M.S.I. QURAIISHI & A.H. CORNFIELD: *Incubation study of nitrogen mineralisation and nitrification in relation to soil pH and level of copper(II) addition. Environmental Pollution*, **4**(2), 159-163 (1972).
17. P. SOMASEGARAN, H.J. HOBEN: *Handbook for Rhizobia, Methods in Legume-Rhizobium Technology. Springer-Verlag New York, Berlin, Heidelberg, London, Paris, Tokyo, Hong Kong, Barcelona, Budapest.* (1994).
18. R. BELL, C.S. EVANS, E.R. ROBERTS: *Decreased incidence of mycorrhizal root tips associated with soil heavy-metal enrichment. Plant and Soil*, **106**(1), 143-145 (1988).
19. R.G. KUPERMAN, M.M. CARRIERO: *Soil heavy metal concentrations, microbial biomass and enzyme activities in a contaminated grassland ecosystem. Soil Biol. Biochem.*, **29**, 179-190 (1997).
20. R.T. HARDIMAN, A. BANIN, B. JACOBY: *The effect of soil type and degree of metal contamination upon uptake of Cd, Pb and Cu in bush beans (Phaseolus vulgaris L.). Plant and Soil*, **81**(1), 17-27 (1984).
21. S.I.A. PEREIRA, A.I.G. LIMA, E.M.A.P. FIGUEIRA: *Heavy metal toxicity in Rhizobium leguminosarum biovar viciae isolated from soils subjected to different sources of heavy-metal contamination: Effects on protein expression. Appl. Soil Ecology*, **33**, 286-293 (2006).
22. S.P. McGRATH, P.C. BROOKES, K.E. GILLER: *Effects of potential toxic metals in soil derived from past applications of sewage sludge on nitrogen fixation by Trifolium repens L. Soil Biol. Biochem.*, **20**, 415–424 (1988).
23. S.P. McGRATH, P.W. LANE: *An explanation for the apparent losses of metals in a long-term field experiment with sewage sludge. Environ. Poll.*, **60**, 235–256 (1989).
24. S.P. McGRATH, A.M. CHAUDRI, K.E. GILLER: *Long-term effects of metals in sewage sludge on soils, microorganisms and plants. J. Ind. Microbiol.*, **14**, 94-104 (1995).
25. T.J. LOGAN, B.J. LINDSAY, L.E. GOINS, J.A. TYAN: *Field assessment treated with alkaline availability to crops: sludge rate response. J. Environ. Qual.*, **26**, 534-550 (1997).
26. Z. TONG, J. M. SADOWSKY: *A Selective Medium for the Isolation and Quantification of Bradyrhizobium japonicum and Bradyrhizobium elkanii Strains from Soils and Inoculants. Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, **60**(2), 581-586 (1993).